

Treaty Elders of Saskatchewan: Our Dream Is That Our Peoples Will One Day Be Clearly Recognized As Nations, by Harold Cardinal and Walter Hildebrandt. Calgary: University of Calgary Press, 2000. Pp. 84.

Bounty and Benevolence: A History of Saskatchewan Treaties, by Arthur Ray and Jim Miller. Montreal: McGill Queen's University Press, 2000. Pp. 299.

Indian Treaty-Making Policy in the United States and Canada, 1867-1877, by Jill St. Germain. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2000. Pp. 243.

The publishing year 2000 saw the addition of three important works to the available literature that addresses the issues of treaties in Canada. Two were a result of Saskatchewan's Office of the Treaty Commissioner (OTC) the other the reworking of an MA thesis. Both *Treaty Elders of Saskatchewan* and *Bounty and Benevolence* were the result of research reports commissioned by the OTC and concentrate on Saskatchewan, while *Indian Treaty-Making Policy* compares policy in the United States and Canada and is a reworking of Jill St. Germain's 1998 MA thesis from Carleton University.

Both *Bounty and Benevolence* and *Treaty Elders of Saskatchewan* resulted from the second mandate of the OTC which began in 1997. As a way to illuminate the historical context of the treaties so that modern-day discussions could take place it was necessary to come to an understanding of the treaty process. As part of this process, in the fall of 1997 Frank Tough was approached to provide a research report. Tough subsequently invited Jim Miller and Arthur Ray to participate in the project. In their study they were expected to incorporate both oral history and written history in order to provide a more rounded interpretation. Judge Arnot, treaty commissioner for Saskatchewan, points out in his foreword of *Bounty and Benevolence*, "it was soon discovered that the amount of information could not be adequately contained in a single report" (xi). As a result, a second report was commissioned and authored by Harold Cardinal and Walter Hildebrandt that took the published form of *Treaty Elders of Saskatchewan*. The authors of *Bounty and Benevolence* in their introduction also indicate that the use of oral history will be left to Cardinal and Hildebrandt and state that "to embody both oral and documentary evidence in a single account proved to be impossible given time constraints" (xvi). This reviewer is unsure as to why the oral history material could not have been included in *Bounty and Benevolence*, as the *Treaty Elders of Saskatchewan* publication totals only 71 pages of narrative, of which the majority has pictures or illustrations which even reduces the amount of text further. It is unclear to this reviewer how this amount of information could not have been integrated into the text of *Bounty and Benevolence* (this is not to distract from the value of *Treaty Elders of Saskatchewan* as stand-alone publication). At the same time the reason of a time constraint is also somewhat problematic as Judge Arnot, in his foreword, states that the authors were able "to produce a manuscript draft and final report in a timely fashion" (x).

Bounty and Benevolence attempts to provide a comprehensive history of treaty making in Saskatchewan by concentrating on the documentary evidence. For the most part the book is successful at providing this comprehensive account. The authors, in their introduction, outline the documentary record that they consulted in the writing of the book. They consulted widely from government archive records, Hudson's Bay Company records, personal papers of treaty negotiators (notably Sir Adams Archibald and Alexander Morris) and government officials

(notably Sir John A. Macdonald Edgar Dewdney and Hayter Reed), official government published materials and secondary works. Interestingly enough the authors point out Hayter Reed as the most important of government bureaucrats (quite rightly), but a perusal of the index shows reference to him on only three pages. This is partly due to the fact that the book only devotes one chapter to the implementation of treaties and it was during the implementation of treaties that Reed had the most influence. A reader not familiar with the history of the treaty and posttreaty period however would assume from the singling out of Reed that his policies would be detailed in this book, which they are not, as his influence was concentrated in the period of implementation especially around treaties 4 and 6.

The book is divided into thirteen chapters the first four deal with the pre-treaty period and include very useful chapters on Aboriginal/Hudson's Bay Company relations, the Selkirk Treaty, the Eastern Treaties as well as the Rupert's Land transfer. The middle seven chapters concentrate on the negotiations, signing, and terms of the treaties. The last two chapters examine implementation and reflections. Overall this work is a very useful study. It has brought together an important period of history into one volume. Although there is little new interpretation that results from the analysis I would suggest that this was not the purpose of this work. As is pointed out in the foreword it was to provide, as unbiased as possible, a historical framework from which dialogue about the treaties can progress, and the authors have done a commendable job of accomplishing this task.

The book has a number of photographs and illustrations that depict both Indian and government leaders as well as maps and a number of illustrations. This reviewer found one glaring error in the photographs depicted. There is a photograph of an individual identified as Ometoway (The Gambler) spelled Ometaway on the actual photo. The caption under the photograph reads that he "vociferously objected to the Hudson's Bay Company's sale of Rupert's Land to Canada during Teaty [*sic*] talks..." The caption then goes on to state that the picture is courtesy of the Provincial Archives of Saskatchewan. As the caption indicates, the individual pictured is Ometaway (The Gambler) however this is not the same individual who was present at the Treaty 4 talks. The individual at the talks was Otahoman (The Gambler) as is indicated in the text and index of the book. The individual in the picture was from the Muscowpetung Reserve and the photograph was taken by Edgar Rossie, it is believed, in 1919.¹ Additionally, credit is given to the Saskatchewan Provincial Archives when in fact the Saskatchewan Indian Federated College owns both the original negatives and the copyright to those negatives.

Overall *Bounty and Benevolence* is an important contribution to the available literature that deals with the history of treaties not only in Saskatchewan but in Canada as well. It is a good starting point in coming to terms with the reasoning and actions of government and Euro-Canadians around the treaty process. Although a more detailed analysis of the eroding of treaty rights in the posttreaty period would have been useful, the pretreaty and treaty periods are sufficiently presented. Despite the lack of oral sources, some minor spelling mistakes, a limited posttreaty analysis and the photograph issue, I would highly recommend this book to students, university faculty and the general public. As I found using the book as a text in a 200-level Indian Studies class, the authors have created an important and handy reference that one can turn to in attempting to explain and understand the treaty process. One very valuable portion of the book is a number of charts that

appear at the end of the book that depict the important players in the negotiations as well as the terms of the treaties and other important information.

Treaty Elders of Saskatchewan is a much different book than *Bounty and Benevolence*, not only in content and writing style but also physical appearance. *Treaty Elders of Saskatchewan* is a coffee-table-style book filled with direct quotes from many Saskatchewan Elders and many colour and black-and-white photographs. This book is a very important contribution to the available literature on treaties because it is one of the few titles that brings a truly Indian perspective and voice to the topic. The only other title in recent times to attempt this was *The True Spirit and Original Intent of Treaty 7*, a work that Hildebrandt was also involved in. The information presented in *Treaty Elders of Saskatchewan* is a result of a number of Treaty Elders forums that were held in Saskatchewan and chaired by the OTC. Cardinal and Hildebrandt have taken what was recorded at these forums in both video and audiotape format, and sometimes both, and produced a highly readable and informative book. Rather than just a collection of reminiscences, the book is filled with numerous important enunciations by Saskatchewan Elders, and Cardinal and Hildebrandt have provided important narrative text to provide context to the Elder's comments. Additionally, throughout the book are references to the Cree terms as a way to provide even more context and understanding to the Elder's perspectives.

The book is divided into twelve chapters, all of which reinforce the spiritual significance of the Treaties and thus the obligation that surrounds these agreements for both Indians and non-Indians who are party to both the written and oral records of these agreements. Topics range from but are not limited to: discussions of conceptions of land, getting along with others, origins, sacred promises to one another, living together, to the evolving interpretations of treaty rights. This book opens up the reader to a vast array of interpretations and history of pretreaty life, treaty negotiations and posttreaty life that previously only a privileged few had the opportunity to learn about. The examples are far too many to list or provide in this review; this reviewer, however, found in practically every quotation provided in the book of a Saskatchewan Elder, a new interpretation, factual account or alternative interpretation was provided that one would be hard pressed to find in other treaty literature. I would highly recommend this book to anyone with an interest not only in treaty issues but also to those interested in the province of Saskatchewan in both historical and present-day contexts. That is not to suggest that this should be or will be the last word on the Elders' interpretations of the treaties, but rather should be, as the Elders indicate in the book, the beginning of an understanding by others of their perspectives. Much more work needs to be done; nonetheless this is an excellent start to the process of understanding the treaties. *The Treaty Elders of Saskatchewan* read in conjunction with *Bounty and Benevolence* will give a reader a well-rounded knowledge base from which to begin exploring the multitude of layers that surround the issues of treaties in Saskatchewan and Canada.

Jill St. Germain, in her book *Indian Treaty-Making Policy in the United States and Canada, 1867-1877*, takes on the challenge of comparing the policies surrounding treaties in both Canada and the United States and for the most part does a commendable job. St. Germain admits that her study is one of comparative government policy and emphasizes why both the Canadian and American governments took part in treaty processes. St. Germain admits that this is only one side of the story

and that Indians were also proactive and often times willing participants in negotiations. She justifies limiting her study to government policy because, as she puts it, "A proper understanding of them (Indian perspectives), a task deemed outside the scope of this undertaking, would require as thorough a knowledge of the several Indian nations represented at the treaty councils as of the Canadian and American government themselves" (xxi). This is not to suggest that Indian input is not considered in the book, but that it plays a secondary role in the analysis. Similar to *Bounty and Benevolence*, evidence from oral history is not included.

The central goal of the book is to respond to Wilcomb Washburn's call to determine where and how Canada and the United States differ in their treaty policies. St. Germain also challenges the assertions made by Canada in 1877 that its policies in comparison with the United States were "humane, just and Christian" (xxii). St. Germain attempts to reach her goals through ten chapters that compare the approaches that both Canada and the United States took to various issues. These topics include, but are not limited to, discussions of precedents that led to treaty signing, the context in which treaty making took place, reserves, "civilization," the buffalo, and Indian status. St. Germain addresses her topics through the treaties of Medicine Lodge (1867) and Fort Laramie (1868) in the United States and the numbered treaties 1—7 (1871—1877) in Canada. She concludes that both governments, through the above-mentioned treaties, attempted "to address particular problems in both countries" (165). She admits that American treaties were less effective, as was demonstrated by the warfare that continued for another decade, and that Canadian authorities were at least able to obtain title to the land they sought. She goes on to argue that both governments believed that they were concluding a chapter on Indian relations but "in both cases ensured a rebirth for the very peoples they sought to absorb" (165).

Overall this an interesting and welcome addition to the literature. The comparative approach that is taken means that there is not as much attention paid to detail as there might be if the study were examining only the Canadian or American situation. As a result I would recommend this book to those who already have some background knowledge in the area of treaties. The book is full of very useful charts that compare the above treaties both within in each nation and between the two nations. These useful charts will make this book an important reference tool to people on both sides of the border.

Rob Nestor
Library
Saskatchewan Indian Federated College
University of Regina

1. Brock Silversides, Brock. 1989. "Edgar Rossie: Dean of Saskatchewan Photographers," *Saskatchewan History* 42, no. 1 (1989): 11—27.