Skinning the Narrative: The Story of Fish Creek

Margaret L. Clarke

The Narrative

Quick! Tell me which of the battles of the North West Rebellion included the death song of a Sioux warrior, a prairie fire set to give cover, and Métis soldiers singing to keep their courage up?

As familiar as students of Canadian history are with the events of 1885, most would not recognize these events as belonging to the Battle of Fish Creek.¹ That battle is usually summarized this way:

On the morning of 24 April 1885, the left column of the Canadian troops under Middleton encountered the Métis men led by Gabriel Dumont in a skirmish defined largely by the geography of Tourond’s Coulee, which the English knew as Fish Creek. At first, Métis sharpshooters carried the battle from their position just under the lip of the coulee. Later, when the military finally got the range set on the cannon, some of the Métis fled back toward Batoche. In the end, the Métis lost 4 men, and the military lost 10 with 45 wounded. Both sides withdrew at the end of the day.

Unfortunately, this sketch leaves out everything that makes that battle unique. A more complete story would run like this:

On the 23rd of April, a dispute between Riel and Dumont led to a split in the Métis force.² Riel took 50 of the 200 men with him and returned to guard Batoche from attack from the north. Also, just previous to the battle Middleton divided his force, leaving him with about 400 troops on the battle side of the river.³ Dumont and Nault made an early morning scouting foray to locate the troops.⁴ On his arrival back with his men, Dumont positioned them and warned them to stay off the trails.⁵ Some of his men were not careful and army scouts encountered them.⁶ Middleton positioned the troops on the edge of the coulee, where they were silhouetted against the skyline and encountered the Métis’ deadly fire.⁷ As Middleton’s troops struggled to return fire, one of the few Sioux warriors present did a war dance on the edge of the coulee in full sight of the soldiers until he was shot. He died singing his death song.⁸
After that, the soldiers struggled to get the range of the Métis fighters. The impact of the cannons on the battle was rapid and devastating for both sides. The Métis kept picking off the gun operators, and the bludgeoning of the slope frightened the Métis warriors who began to desert. By mid-afternoon, the men on the lower slopes had slipped away and there were approximately 50 men left on the less-exposed upper slopes of the ravine. When Dumont realized that the greater portion of his men had fled, he ordered his followers to start a prairie fire under cover of which they could advance, drive the soldiers back, and possibly pick up some ammunition left behind in their flight. After the unsuccessful advance during the prairie fire, the troops reported singing coming from the Métis warriors. Edouard Dumont arrived with 80 men to reinforce the Métis troop later in the day. In the evening, both sides retreated.

Cultural Views

As I compared the various versions of the narrative from the various sources, I found the usual discrepancies — numbers of troops on each side, movements of individuals, etc; but toward the end of the narrative, I found a more notable difference. The accounts of Métis warriors singing in battle conflicted from account to account. Certain of these differences in the accounts are directly answerable to the cultural views of participants and historians. The North West Rebellion of 1885 was explicitly a cultural conflict between the French/Native, Catholic Métis and the English, Anglican dominant society of the Canadian Dominion. In the subtext of some accounts, contacts and conflicts with other cultures are visible. Examination of various accounts of the song sung by the Métis warriors reveals evidence of French Canadien influence on the narrative — something rarely noted, or considered only in the context of Church records.

Two Camps

The accounts of the Battle of Fish Creek, as well as being the stories of a direct military conflict between the Métis and the Dominion of Canada, are also a clear example of the truth of the saying, “History is written by the winners.” Until the last two decades, little attempt was made by Canadian historians to integrate the accounts from the two camps. The most comprehensive account is probably found in Beal and MacLeod’s *Prairie Fire* (1985), although one should also credit Joseph Kinsey Howard, whose work contains a great deal more detail in many relevant areas; perhaps if an annotated edition of *Strange Empire* is released in the future, we will be able to directly examine his sources.

One strange facet in the history of the existing archival records of that specific event is that both of the collections that contain personal recollections, the Clouthier collection and that of La Société Historique Métisse (Provincial Archives of Manitoba), have received extensive preparation for publication, but not been published as widely as was planned. It is to be hoped that with a revival of interest in the multiple voices of history, this research could be made more accessible.

There are portions of the story only available in the Métis personal accounts of the battle. Such details as the 4:00 a.m. scouting sortie by Gabriel Dumont and Napoleon Nault, the desertion by some of the Métis men, Dumont’s attempts to rally them, and the various ways the men encouraged each other in protecting their community are not found in official accounts; nor are the stories of hardship
experienced by the men lying in ditches half-filled with icy water in the ravine, or the anguish they felt for the welfare of their homes and families. Further, little academic work has been done with even the best known accounts, such as the Dumont reminiscences. There is a real gap, a missing area, in the academic analysis of accounts and in the public availability of all these accounts.

**Integrating the Stories**

In order to tell the whole story of Fish Creek, it is important that both sides of the story receive equal coverage. If the story of the battle includes the government reasons for the Rebellion, it should also include a good explanation of the Métis reasons, not only the Church’s version, where the priests apologized for their ignorant parishioners and for Riel’s illness, or Riel’s version, full of dreams of his own glory and of the new nation he was creating, but also the voice of Dumont and those soldiers who were protecting their homes and way of life. If the story includes tales of the soldiers’ hardship in fighting on the prairie in the early spring, let soldiers from both sides be heard.

It may also be necessary, in telling the story, to include the evidence from both sides of how they used the numbers of troops, when telling their version of the events, to make themselves look better. There may be other evidence of similar shadings of the stories that served to widen the gap between the government of Canada and, by extension, the settlers they brought to the Plains, and the Métis people who were the original settlers.

Another important issue in this discussion is that of language. Although many of the Métis were multilingual, their personal, private histories are preserved almost exclusively in the French language. As a majority of Canadians today are unilingual English speakers, including many of the prairie Métis who have lost connection with their ancestral background, access to the heart of the Métis histories is difficult. Resurrecting all the accounts of this battle is the beginning of the process of recovering some of that history.

**Fear and Encouragement — the Battle Song**

The story of the Métis men encouraging each other with song affirms some of the more recent influences on the story, as well as cultural differences at the time. To understand some of the incidents related to encouragement of the troops, it is important to remember how different the two groups of fighting men were. The army men were strangers to each other, as well as to their commanders; the Métis men were friends, neighbours, relations who had hunted, worked and partied together. This context helps explain the reports of how the two groups were encouraged.

The Métis reported hearing the soldiers being sworn at: “We could hear the English officers who were shouting “God-damn” at the soldiers who were refusing to march forward.” This apparently comes from such accounts as J. Caron’s in “Bataille de Fish Creek, Duck Lake et Batoche,” which in the English translation uses the same words. F. Tourond’s account says that “The officers were forcing their soldiers on with whips and shouting terrible God-damns. And when they themselves heard the bullets hissing by, they allowed the soldiers to go their own way, and they in turn would run away as fast as they could.”

Meanwhile, the Métis were encouraging each other. Lépine reported them praying together; Charles Trottier reported calling out “Courage, courage, and
pray God"; Clouthier reported that Joseph Delorme was calling for the men to take courage and defend themselves. The best example of the Métis encouraging each other is the reports of singing: these come to us filtered through the layers of academic research. Arriving at the original accounts has its own story.

There are various accounts in published histories of that time. The best known reference to the Métis singing during the battle is probably found in Beal and MacLeod's *Prairie Fire*, where the song is called one of "the old songs of Pierre Falcon." One of Gabriel Dumont's friends and hunting companions (see Elie Dumont's interview, Saskatchewan Archives Board), Charles Trottier, testified that during the battle "All of a sudden I heard a young man singing in French the song of the Bois Brûlés, the song of Falcon. It encouraged me." However, in Hold High Your Heads, by de Tremaudan, the song is given as "an old song of Napoleon the First." This is a direct quote from Dumont's account.

To untangle this confusion, it may be useful to begin with the life of Pierre Falcon. This first-generation Métis was a friend and associate of Cuthbert Grant. He had been sent to school in Montreal from 1798 to 1806. During that time, he would have been exposed to military songs from the France of Napoleon. When he returned to the prairies, he wrote many songs and may have used some of the melodies he heard while in Montreal; he wrote, among these, a song about the Seven Oaks Massacre, claimed by some to be the first real Métis engagement. This is the songwriter to whom Charles Trottier referred, and to which Beal and MacLeod attributed the battle song.

On the other hand, the Dumont report that his men were singing a song of Napoleon was recorded by the recorder of Montreal (according to Stanley) or Quebec City (according to Barnholden). Barnholden, who translated the second account, gave some context to the two Dumont narratives:

During his speaking tour of Quebec in 1887 and 1888, Dumont dictated his first memoir of the "Riel Rebellion" to a group of journalists and politicians. His story was taken down by B.A.T. Montigny, the recorder for Quebec City. The dictation was read back to him one month later for his approval and, after being edited by Adolphe Ouimet, was privately published as part of *La Vérité sur la Question Métisse au Nord-Ouest* (1889). The book, long out of print, is a polemic that was used to advance the fortunes of the Quebec Liberal Party.

G.F.G. Stanley translated this first Dumont memoir into English in the 1949 issue of the Canadian Historical Review—an obscure publication, perhaps, but not so arcane as to be unavailable in the libraries of any large Canadian city. It is extensively quoted in almost any work on Riel and any aspect of the "rebellion."

Dumont's second memoir, published here for the first time, was dictated in 1903, probably in the confines of some friend's parlour, over drinks and food, and definitely lacks the overt political agenda tacked on to the first dictation of 1888. This second memoir was also delivered eighteen years after the main events described therein actually occurred. Until now, no one has published or translated the second dictation, and it is seldom referred to in the literature on the Métis experience.

If, instead of naming the song that was being sung, Dumont sang a bit of it (something a person used to oral culture would do without second thought), the
company listening may have identified the tune and written it in as a song of Napoleon. This is, however, pure conjecture.

To get down to the bones of the story, I needed the aid of a French Metis historian. Diane Payment urged me to look at:

1. The testimonies/accounts collected by Gabriel Clouthier in 1886 for Bishop Taché of St. Boniface, and the correspondence of Bishop Taché: extensive transcriptions and contextual notations have been made on these sources in preparation for publishing, which unfortunately never happened. The majority of these notes are also available for review. These documents are in the Archives du Centre du Patrimoine in St. Boniface They are not available on microfilm.

2. The Papers of the Union Nationale and Société historique Métisse at the Provincial Archives of Manitoba: These include accounts by Métis including Gabriel Dumont based on local interviews done around 1909 and [on] de Trémaudan’s notes. The latter fonds [those based on de Trémaudan’s notes] will be transferred to the Centre du Patrimoine sometime this year, however they are still currently housed at the PAM. I’m not sure what those archives have there, but it would be worth checking into.27

I found that the Métis accounts were indeed in the relevant archives, but not indexed under relevant subject indexes on the topics of “the 1885 Rebellion” or “the Battle of Fish Creek.” The first collection was indexed under Gabriel Clouthier and Bishop Taché; the second collection was indexed only as the Papers of the Union Nationale and as de Trémaudan, author. I would never have found the accounts without the tip from my colleague. I admit that part of the explanation for that rests with my own ethnocentrism: I knew of the Union Nationale and their work preserving the history of the Metis through the studies of a fellow student, Lisa Poitras; but, I believed that Hold High Your Heads, by de Trémaudan, the only English language publication of his work, was reflective of the breadth of the Union Nationale’s research. My explorations of the accounts convinced me otherwise.

First, there is another account of the “singing” story, collected by Abbé Gabriel Clouthier for Bishop Taché. He recorded that Isidore Dumas reported the song as:

Courage, courage, chasseurs, courage  
Ne craignez point de tapage  
Soyez pas épouvantes  
Des canons de ces Anglais.28

This is not part of any Metis song in the sparse collections I was able to find29; also, Alfred Fortier, archivist at the St. Boniface Historical Association, did not recognize it. He said that it is not a Pierre Falcon song — not his style. He added that the Metis community connected the song Riel wrote with this battle, but admitted that it was probably associated after the fact.30

The same story, expanded, appears in de Trémaudan’s unpublished article on the battle.31 One footnote of particular interest declares that Isidore Dumas, who in this account and others is the singer of the battle song, is not Métis by birth but French-Canadien.32 That section reads:

“Je crois que j’ai peur”, dit tout a coup Isidore Dumas (footnote 1) à Gilbert Berland. — “Non, lui répond ce dernier, tu n’as pas peur, ta figure ne change pas.” — “Si je chantais”, dit Isidore. — “Oui, C’est ça, réplique Berland, ça donnera du courage à nos hommes. Alons il lui vient a l’esprit
une chanson que son père lui avait apprise dans sa jeunesse [inserted in ink "au Bas Canada"] C'était un refrain qui redisaït les luttes antiques des deux races et s'appliquait merveilleusement aux circonstances:

Courage, courage, chasseurs, courage,
Ne craignez pas le tapage,
Ne soyez pas épouvantés
Du canon de ces Anglais.\textsuperscript{53}

The same song was quoted in both collections. But what song is it? Howard identified the song sung by Isidore Dumas as

“Malbrouck” the derisive dirge which eighteenth century France had chanted for Winston Churchill’s renowned ancestor, the Duke of Marlborough, and everyone came in on the roaring chorus: “Mironton, mironton, mirontaine!”[sic] Someone else started “Falcon’s Song,” and from somewhere, incredibly came an instrumental accompaniment; one of the rebel warriors had brought along his flute.\textsuperscript{54}

Given that Howard’s book has no footnotes, it is impossible to credit his sources. It is believed by some that he interviewed some of the Metis during their stay in Montana after the rebellion. His bibliography, posthumously compiled by Rosalea Fox, included two songbooks\textsuperscript{55} and a list of various interviewees.\textsuperscript{56}

Further research revealed the existence of a tune titled “Marche du roi Malbrouck” in the traditional music of France.\textsuperscript{37} I was not able to find music and lyrics together. Further communication with the owner of the “tradfrance.com” website led to another tune he thought was more likely to be the source of the battle song:

However there is a very popular French old song called “Malbrough s’en va-t-en guerre” you will find the words, music and some historical informations (in French) on both

\url{http://perso.club-internet.fr/bmarcore/Tine/E126.htm} \url{http://ourworld.compuserve.com/homepages/Thierry_Klein/malbroug.htm}

but no mention in this song of the verse you quoted: Courage, courage etc... Besides, I observe that these words do not really fit with the music of the popular version.

My quick research on these particular words was fruitless.\textsuperscript{38}

That other song, “Malbrough s’en va-t-en guerre,” does contain the refrain which Howard quoted: “Mironton, mironton, mirontaine”\textsuperscript{59}; but I found no song excerpt containing those lyrics in the Metis collections. The exact identity of the song remains an open question; this illustrates how much of the history of the Métis are lost, with only traces left in collections controlled by the dominant society.

The Bones

The main impression I received from my research is that the accounts of this battle, both published and unpublished, encapsulate the “two solitudes” reality of Canada in the history of the West. There are many accounts that only tell one side of the story, either Metis or military. In recent years, historians have begun to integrate some of the Metis stories with the military accounts to tell a more complete chronicle; but most of them seem to rely on Gabriel Dumont’s published accounts
and on the Metis scouting reports found after the fall of Batoche. Little of the extensive interviews conducted by Clouthier and by the Union Nationale have seen public exposure, except in the restricted group of Francophone Metis academics.

This means that the story as we know it lacks a holistic perspective. While we have a fairly complete description of the battle from the military point of view, we know little of the Métis' experience. I hope this exploration has revealed a little bit more of that perspective. With the Metis as with the First Nations' voice in history, telling the whole truth broadens our view of the participants and ennobles them.

Notes
1. Parks Canada Heritage funded the research for this article as part of a project to assemble a more complete bibliography of the battle.
7. Middleton, Suppression of the Rebellion, 32; Morton, Last War Drum, 64; Boulton, Reminiscences, 227, 228; Howard, Strange Empire, 361; Mulvany, History, 128.
10. Stanley, "Gabriel Dumont's Account," 261; Middleton, Suppression of the Rebellion, 39; Rusden, “Notes,” 261; Beal and MacLeod, Prairie Fire, 231; Morton, Last War Drum, 67; Howard, Strange Empire, 363; de Tremuaudan, Hold High Your Heads, 133.
12. Glenbow Museum Archives, Downdey Papers, p. 2235; Stanley, "Gabriel Dumont's Account," 262; Beale and MacLeod, 
Prairie Fire, 231; Howard, Strange Empire, 364; Morton, Last War Drum, 67, 68.
13. Stanley, "Gabriel Dumont's Account," 262; Middleton, Suppression of the Rebellion, 36; Boulton, 
Reminiscences, 235, 236; Rusden, "Notes," 263; Howard, Strange Empire, 364, Morton, Last War Drum, 67, 68; Beale and MacLeod, Prairie Fire, 232; de Tremaudan, Hold High Your Heads, 133.
15. Bob Beal and Rudy Wiebe, War in the West: Voices of the 1885 Rebellion (Toronto: McClelland and Stewart, 1985), 89.
16. Ibid.
17. Ibid., 19, "Bataille de Fish Creek, Duck Lake et Batoche."
18. Glenbow Museum Archives, Maxime Lépine, Downdey Papers, Northwest Rebellion, Riel (MG 27, IC4, Volume 6, pages.), 2239-2241, "No. 139 — Mr. Lepine's Report on the battle of Friday."
23. de Tremaudan, Hold High Your Heads, 133.
24. Stanley, "Gabriel Dumont's Account"; also in Ouimet and de Montigny, La vérité sur la question métisse.
29. Métis songs: Visiting was the Métis Way (Regina: Gabriel Dumont Institute, 1993); Barbara Cass-Beggs, Seven Métis Songs of Saskatchewan (Don Mills, ON: BMI Canada, 1967); Margaret MacLeod (ed.), Songs of Old Manitoba (Toronto: Ryerson Press, 1959).
31. De Trémaudan, A.H. "Sylvis," "La Bataille de Fish Creek," Provincial Archives of Manitoba, MG10 F1, Box 12, La Société Historique Métisse, in French.
32. Ibid., 20.
33. Ibid., 20, 21.
34. Howard, Strange Empire, 362, 363.
35. Ibid., 570; Marius Barbeau, Folk Songs of Old Quebec (Ottawa: National Museum of Canada, Department of Mines), 579; Marius Barbeau, "Voyageur Songs," The Beaver (June 1941).
38. Sylvain Piron, personal information, November 15, 2001.