

“A People Akin to Mine”: Indians and Highlanders within the British Empire*

Veronica Strong-Boag

In Paddling Her Own Canoe: the Times and Texts of E. Pauline Johnson (Tekahionwake) Carole Gerson and I observed that Johnson (1861-1913) claimed an affinity with the Highland Scots. This article reflects on the relationship Johnson drew to our attention. It begins with a brief appraisal of the Highland and Celtic revivals of the 18th and 19th centuries and moves to examine the military, fur trade and settlement, and discursive linkages of the Scots and Native North Americans. It offers a preliminary explanation as to why Johnson, the champion of the dispossessed of one continent, might have looked to Northern Britain.

Dans Paddling Her Own Canoe: the Times and Texts of E. Pauline Johnson (Tekahionwake) Carole Gerson et moi-même avons observé que Johnson (1861-1913) déclarait avoir des affinités avec les Écossais des Highlands. Cet article révèle le rapport que Johnson a porté à notre attention. L'article commence par une brève évaluation de la résurgence des Highlands et de la résurgence celtique au 18^e et au 19^e siècles. Ensuite il examine l'aspect militaire, le commerce des fourrures et les colonies de peuplement et les liens discursifs entre les Écossais et les Indiens d'Amérique du Nord. Cet article nous donne une explication préliminaire sur la raison pour laquelle Johnson, la championne des dépossédés sur un continent, a pu se tourner vers le Nord de la Grande-Bretagne.

In Paddling Her Own Canoe: the Times and Texts of E. Pauline Johnson (Tekahionwake) Carole Gerson and I observed that E. Pauline Johnson (1861-1913), a Canadian reader of Robbie Burns and Walter Scott, claimed an affinity with the Highland Scots.¹ While on a London tour in the 1890s, this daughter of an English immigrant and an Iroquois chief, himself a Scottish rite mason, reflected that “sometimes I feel I must get away to the Highlands among a people who seem somehow akin to mine.”² British critics similarly invoked a Celtic link in comparing the Mohawk-English Canadian writer, performer and nationalist to Boadicea, the legendary queen of the Iceni who had died fighting the injustice of

imperial Rome.³ Unfortunately, no explanation or further reflection on such observations seems to have survived in Johnson's extensive body of published and unpublished works. Two major reference texts on the Scottish-North American connection similarly offer little help in explaining her claim of kinship, ignoring as they regularly do both Natives and Canada in the course of treating Scots, especially the Lowland and Irish communities, as unproblematic pioneers and settlers casually displacing the continent's original inhabitants.⁴ James Hunter is more thoughtful in devoting a chapter in *A Dance Called America. The Scottish Highlands, The United States and Canada* (1994) to the problematic relationship of two colonized peoples, but his attention for the most part lies elsewhere. Despite the plethora of Highland names that distinguishes post-contact history and more than hints at an extended relationship, studies of North American First Nations similarly rarely extrapolate beyond individual cases to examine the collective relations of the Natives of Northern Britain and Northern North America.⁵

On the Six Nations Territory, home of the Iroquois Confederacy in Southern Ontario, Johnson grew to maturity as champions of subordinate cultures and critics of empires, from Toronto's Highland Society to London's Aboriginal Protection Society, were rallying diverse, and sometimes contradictory, communities of interest. Whether on the periphery of the imperial heartland itself or in the far reaches of the British Empire, Scots and Indians fought for cultural survival and political relevance. Losing national independence in the Union of 1707, facing the final defeat of the Stuarts in 1745 and the misery of the Highland Clearances and famines in the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries, numerous Scots set out as soldiers and emigrants to guarantee, ironically enough, empire in other climes. In the Americas, Native peoples created a broad range of political alliances and strategies as they struggled during the same years with the French, British and Spanish invaders.

Indians and Scots met in the course of early European exploration, conflict, and settlement in the New World. With the defeat of New France and the triumph of the United States, many refugees from old Scotia and North American victims of European advance found themselves in what would become Canada, a land to be haunted by lost causes. Over time both groups of the vanquished faced romanticization by the victors, symbolized in the iconic figures of the heroic Highlander immortalized in Rob Roy and the Waverley novels of Walter Scott and the noble Onondaga

chief, Hiawatha, celebrated by Henry Wadsworth Longfellow.

By pointing to the Celtic fringe in distinguishing among the imperial British, Pauline Johnson made a significant connection. Like Indians, the Scots had been the Empire's victims. In Canada, however, many rose to prominence, supplying for example both the first prime minister, John A. Macdonald, and the first leader of the opposition, Alexander Mackenzie. This upward trajectory held obvious appeal for a Native champion, all the more so when the two peoples had a long history of association. This article reflects further on the relationship Pauline Johnson drew to the attention of her British audiences. It begins with a brief appraisal of the Highland and Celtic revivals of the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries and then moves to an examination of the military, fur trade and settlement, and discursive linkages of European and North American Natives within the British Empire. It offers a preliminary explanation as to why Johnson, champion of the dispossessed of one continent might have claimed kinship with the Natives of Northern Britain.

Highland and Celtic Revivals

Johnson's identification with an allied and subordinated nation within the British Isles occurred in the midst of the Victorian Age's continuing recuperation of the Highland Scots who came to embody the romantic heart of Caledonia, to stand as idealized representatives of the entire northern kingdom.⁶ Like Aboriginal North Americans, those who lived north of the Great Glen had commonly been designated savages. As one historian of Scotland has put it, Highlanders had long been regarded as "speakers of an outlandish jargon, vagabonds outside the law, foreign despoilers of the country ... apparently people originally and irreducibly different".⁷ To a host of critics, northern clansmen engaged in deer-hunting or salmon fishing or diplomacy, all regarded as pursuits appropriate only for the aristocracy, were readily dismissed as lazy and a cause of hilarity. The Scottish buffoon with illusions of sovereignty provided a staple of British popular culture just as the "cigar store" effigy or the Indian princess would in the New World.⁸

Long before the union of the two kingdoms, ideas about the Northern Britons, especially the Catholic and the Celt, served to signal the superiority of their southern foes. Clearances and emigration might be regretted but landlords and governments largely accepted their necessity

as the price of progress for a backward people.⁹ With the final defeat of the Jacobite cause and the sailing of thousands of economic refugees over the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries, a series of romantic fictions slowly but steadily recuperated the reputation of the Highlands and their inhabitants.¹⁰ In the context of the Enlightenment, the formerly scorned adversary increasingly became the "noble savage" and the previously forbidding landscape emerged as "picturesque".¹¹ Efforts to erase the Gaelic language and to impose southern practices gradually fell out of fashion as such Scots became mythologized complements to more civilized neighbours. Whether Scots were Highland or Lowland, Catholic or Protestant, Jacobites or advocates of the Hanoverians, they came collectively to be identified with, or even reduced to, the single image of the kilted, Jacobite, often Catholic Highlander. Influential writers like Matthew Arnold, among others, invented a portrait of Celtic spirit and romance to balance the colder, more pragmatic Anglo-Saxon virtues which were believed to sustain the commercial and diplomatic ambitions of Greater England, not to mention the canny merchants of Glasgow and Edinburgh. By the late nineteenth century, mounting pressure for Gaelic in schools and a wave of Gaelic poetry suggested how far previously scorned Scots had come from the killing fields of Culloden.¹²

For early champions of imperial expansion like Prime Minister William Pitt and James Wolfe, conqueror of Scotland and Quebec, Scotland's military traditions were especially invaluable. The eighteenth century ushered in the age of the plaid regiments, which, mustered from Highlander and Lowlander alike, integrated the Highland cult into the British army. Integration was so complete that by 1881 "Lowland regiments, even those whose past battle honours were gained in opposition to Highlanders," were instructed "to wear tartan 'trews' and Highland-style doublets."¹³ As Peter Womack has noted in *Improvement and Romance*, traditions of "audacity, subordination, patriarchal loyalty, sacrifice, chauvinism, enthusiasm, personal courage" were harnessed to the cause of capitalist expansion.¹⁴ The long-standing "warlike and regressive Other, the closest to home, Highlanders were to repeat their mythic role in the Peninsula [in Spain in the war against Napoleon] across the face of the earth, the indispensable atavistic natives in the Victorian triumph of peace and progress."¹⁵ Within the nominal unity of an evolving international empire, kilted, pipe-playing, and dirk-carrying Scots became critical allies, symbols both of the benefits of conquest and the

potential for preserving a certain privileged diversity. Allocated the status of exotic and impoverished but heavily romanticized kin, if they wished for power, they had to pursue it in the far-flung legions of their conquerors.

Rehabilitation was not restricted to Scotland. While the Irish largely remained "Celtic Calibans" or "domestic degenerates,"¹⁶ the Welsh also incurred rehabilitation. As John Ellis has effectively demonstrated, the 1911 investiture of the Prince of Wales, a fine example of Eric Hobsbawn's invented tradition, presented "a familial hierarchy of power in which the Celt was delegated a subordinate position as the embodiment of a feminine or an immature masculine character."¹⁷ The result emphasized both initial conquest and "ultimate reconciliation and recognition of ethnically distinct nationalities."¹⁸

To be sure, the redemption of the Scots did not proceed at the same pace everywhere. Recent studies suggest that disdain persisted well into the twentieth century in Nova Scotia, the destination of so many transplanted Highlanders.¹⁹ Ultimately only the drive for a tartan-based tourism as an antidote to economic depression in the 1930s offered New World Scots an opportunity to share in the idealization of their heritage. Like North American Natives, poor settlers in a marginal region were not readily incorporated into a nation and a continent that increasingly embraced Anglo-conformity and had little interest in old relationships or obligations. Such resistance was in keeping with the failure to recognize equals that Pauline Johnson often perceived in North America, if more usually in the United States.

Military Peoples

The "savages" of two continents met in the context of European expansion. Shortly after the defeat of the clans and Bonnie Prince Charlie, the Seven Years War brought Scottish regiments to North America. Here they joined with the Iroquois to defeat the French, who credited them with "a ferocity natural to savages."²⁰ Nor were England's Gaelic-speaking recruits always readily distinguishable from New World peoples. One anecdote from the French wars captured the mix-ups possible in a multinational and multi-lingual army:

a soldier of another regiment, who was a sentinel detached from

an advanced guard, seeing a man coming out of the wood, with his hair hanging loose, and wrapped up in a dark-coloured plaid, he challenged him repeatedly, and receiving no answer (the weather being hazy), he fired at him and killed him; the guard being alarmed, the serjeant ran out to know the cause, and the unhappy sentinel, strongly repossessed that it was an Indian, with a blanket about him, who came skulking to take a prisoner or a scalp, cried out, "I have killed an Indian! I have killed an Indian!" but, upon being undeceived by the serjeant, who went out to take a view of the dead man, and being told that he was one of our own men and a highlander, he was oppressed with grief and fright he fell ill, and was despaired of for some days. In consequence of this accident, most of these young soldiers being raw and inexperienced, and very few of them conversant in or able to talk English (*which was particularly his case who was killed) these regiments were ordered to do no more duty for some time.²¹

Confusion did not necessarily disappear as Scots became accustomed to the new land. While Native North Americans experimented with European goods to create eclectic wardrobes, newcomers also proved susceptible to the convenience of Aboriginal dress, especially moccasins, leggings, breechclouts, and hunting shirts.²² In addition, many Highlanders retained their old fashion for long hair. Such tresses, held by the Protestant cosmology of the day to signal excessive pride and particularly identified with the Royal House of Stuart, provided a further visual linkage between two peoples equally suspect for independence and bellicosity.²³ No wonder travelers such as the noted Peter Kalm "found it difficult to distinguish European captives from their captors."²⁴ Uncertainty was all the greater when North American Natives could be found on both sides of the French-English divide and when some Scots held to the "aulde alliance" with France, their continental ally against their island foe. From the perspective of English strategists, there must sometimes have seemed little to choose between two groups of warrior savages, almost equally incomprehensible in their language, dress, and deportment.

Indians could be ready observers of such comparisons. When plaid regiments arrived in the colony of New York in the 1750s, spectators remarked that

they were caressed by all ranks and orders of men, but more particularly by the Indians. On the march to Albany, the Indians flocked from all quarters to see the strangers who, they believed, were of the same extraction as themselves, and therefore received them as brothers.²⁵

In linking Indigenous peoples within the Empire, such recognition anticipated later claims of kinship like that by Pauline Johnson.

With the defeat of the French, Scottish veterans were offered American lands. Many officers and men of regiments such as Montgomery's Highlanders accepted. While Gaelic settlements existed in the southern states, Sir William Johnson, Britain's Indian Superintendent in the American colonies and commander of both Iroquois and Scots during the French conflict, proffered holdings in New York's Mohawk Valley. Often favouring clan and regimental groups, Europe's erstwhile Natives sent for families and settled with hope in the traditional territory of Britain's Iroquois allies.²⁶ Closely allied with the Iroquois and partnered with Molly Brant, a Mohawk clan matron, the lordly Irish-born Johnson also set about to foster strong ties of deference and obligation with the newcomers.²⁷ Native and newcomer met within a community that recognized military traditions, clan-based kinship systems, ethnic pluralism, and social hierarchy.

This inter-racial experiment was short-lived. In the American Revolutionary War many Scots and Iroquois found themselves on the same side. Both sets of Loyalists, designated by one observer as a "band of brothers ... rarely known to be worsted in any skirmish or action,"²⁸ became critical participants in the conflict's fierce guerrilla campaigns, especially in the Mohawk Valley where the terrain must readily have evoked memories of another northern frontier. While the Iroquois were much feared by rebel forces, Marianne McLean, the author of the major study of the Glengarry Highlanders, argues that the latter also "may actually have had a greater military value than their numbers warranted, since the American patriots seemed to dread the Highland Scots in particular."²⁹ At the end of the war, kilted and feathered Loyalists fled north, sometimes together as with the group of Six Nations warriors and "thirty armed Highlanders" led by Sir John Johnson in May 1775.³⁰

In Canada they set out to form Gaelic and Native enclaves where

their languages and institutions could flourish. The Iroquois formed two significant settlements, one on the Grand River and the other on the Bay of Quinte. Together with other refugees from Scotland's hard times, loyalists contributed to three centres of Highland culture — the Island of St. John (later Prince Edward Island), Cape Breton, and the Glengarry district of Canada. Whether speaking Gaelic or Mohawk (the leading language of the Canadian Iroquois), both groups were alien allies on imperial terrain.

In Canada the military connection between the two communities continued for some time. The War of 1812 saw the Iroquois and the Scots joining once more in skirmishes and battles that retained Canada against American assaults. When in 1824 the body of the hero of the Battle of Lundy's Lane, General Issac Brock, was re-interred, the two communities readily re-united in celebration of their common history. As Janet Carnochan, an early nationalist historian, pointed out, "Alike were seen the picturesque dress of the Highlanders and the no less striking garb of the red men, the relatives of McDonnell being in Highland costume, and young [John] Brant from Grand river, with other chiefs, being in full Indian dress."³¹ Pauline Johnson's grandfather, "Smoke" Johnson, whose contribution to the defense of the British Empire during the War of 1812 earned him a chieftainship, was also there. Later in the 1860s Six Nations volunteers, including George Henry Martin Johnson, Pauline's father, joined those from Glengarry in stemming the Fenian invasions from the U.S. In 1870 Iroquois canoeists assisted Colonel Garnet Wolseley in confirming Canadian possession of the prairies and again paddled with him during the imperial relief expedition to Khar-toum in the mid-1880s.³²

Post-Confederation Canadian writers attempting to establish a nationalist iconography enthusiastically recalled the common military enterprises that had set the foundations of the dominion. The Canada Firster and writer, Charles Mair, recognized Tecumseh, the Shawnee war chief, who died at the battle of Moravietown in 1813, in his poem of the same name. Mair's friend, Pauline Johnson, doggedly celebrated loyalism and anti-Americanism in poetry and prose, earning her the title of a "true daughter of the flag."³³ In 1886, at the Brantford inauguration of a statue of the Mohawk Loyalist chief, Joseph Brant, she reminded listeners of the old alliance and the "allegiance from thy Indian son."³⁴ In general, however, the Native contribution to Canada's survival became easier to

ignore once the immediate threat from the Americans subsided after the end of the Fenian attacks.

Yet, if European recognition of North American Natives as founding peoples faltered, Iroquois warriors contributed to a continuing military history. While unable to form distinct military units, they regularly enlisted in conflicts in which Canada was engaged. Some served as officers in the Canadian army and some died under Canadian colours. The Dominion's Scots also maintained their martial history but this in contrast was officially embraced with the establishment of Canada's own Highland regiments.³⁵ While Governor-General Lord Dufferin asserted in 1874 that his hosts, the Six Nations, possessed a "distinct nationality," one "happily incorporated with the British Empire," no different in essence from the "French, English, Irish, and Scot" who had also thrown their lot in with Canada, Aboriginal nations, like the French Canadians until the creation of the Royal 22nd after World War I, were denied critical symbolic recognition in the armed forces.³⁶

In laying claim to equality, subordinated Iroquois and Scots valued military credentials. Inclusion in imperial adventures offered men, a momentary band of brothers, an opportunity to perform a common masculinity. A shared experience within the imperial armed forces also encouraged, as Katie Trumpener has argued, "the development of an expanded sense of nationality and shared Britishness." As a critical basis of male claims to the franchise, the emerging expression of full citizenship in the 19th century, military service also offered men marginalized by racist constructions the promise of a place in the masculinist state, whether British or Canadian, of the day.³⁷

Not surprisingly, both Scots and North American Natives were far from unanimous about working with the imperial power. For the staunchest critics, assimilation or integration, whether in the military or elsewhere, was always anathema. Determined Scottish nationalists did not forget the grievances of the old land. Native North Americans found good reason to resist the colonizers that forced them from territory and denied them national recognition. Appeals to the League of Nations and the United Nations, as well as armed confrontations such as Oka in 1990, were but singular moments in a continuing struggle. At the beginning of the 21st century, standoffs, whether military or diplomatic, continue in North America while Scotland experiments with its first parliament in centuries and continues to flirt with the idea of full independence. Resist-

ance co-existed with equally long-standing explorations of the possibilities of accommodation as Scots and Natives explored individual and collective options.

Fur Trade and Settlement

Although military linkages remain among the most visible, as the 2000-2001 Canadian Broadcasting Corporation production of "Canada: A People's History" continues to suggest, most contacts among different groups in North America occurred in the course of economic activities. Even before the American Revolutionary War, Natives and Scots, notably the Orkneymen of the Hudson Bay Company (HBC) and the nations of the Northwest had often been in close proximity.³⁸ With the 1770s founding of the Northwest Company (NWC), managed for the most part by Highlanders such as Simon McTavish and James McGill, contact became closer still. In many ways the NWC-HBC rivalry, with its dramatic history of feuds and confrontations, recalled older animosities from the British Isles.³⁹ An early description of the NWC partners at Fort William, the site of the annual summer rendezvous of summer and winter partners, apparently named in 1807 after trader Sir William McGillivray but reminiscent of a major centre of the same name in the Scottish Highlands, conveyed both the transatlantic connection and the emergence of hybrid traditions:

the feudal character of the Highlander, shone out magnificently. Every partner who had charge of an inferior post felt like the chieftain of a Highland clan. To him a visit to the grand conference at Fort William was a most important event, and he repaired thither as to a meeting of Parliament. They were wrapped in huge furs ... At Fort William an immense wooden building was the council chamber and also the banqueting hall, decorated with Indian arms and accouterments, and with trophies of the fur trade.⁴⁰

As the headquarters of the NWC, Montreal welcomed both groups. One Presbyterian Scot, John Galt, left a disapproving comment on this mingling: "not a few Iroquois Indians, who, in tawdry costume ... may be seen lounging in groups about the streets; not infrequently relieved by

the national-looking Highlanders, from the Canadian Glengarry.⁴¹ What might be taken for granted on the frontier of contact increasingly met disapproval in the metropolis where ideas of rank and privilege, increasingly influenced by the racial science of the day, more and more excluded the North American Native.⁴²

While the Iroquois and other Natives commonly remained labourers in the fur industry and Northern Britons were much more likely to prosper, close ties, including marriage often knit together Scottish and Native clans. Their intimacy might not be unique but the sheer numbers of Scots fur traders and the similarities between them and those they encountered were significant. Far from unusual was the way that lives intersected on a daily basis as with Northwest Native families and the famed explorer, Alexander Mackenzie (1764-1820), the son of a Loyalist Highlander from the Isle of Lewis and the father of at least one Mixed-race child.⁴³ The community of interest that might develop was summed up in the life of still another Highland immigrant and HBC factor, Angus MacDonald, who was said to be

excessively fond of the life of the aborigine and would rather live in a tent, or lodge, than in a house built in accordance with civilised plans ... He was fond of telling Indian stories and legends and would sometimes keep an audience spellbound when ... telling some bloodcurdling Indian story in which he had borne a conspicuous part. He could talk several Indian languages and lived a long time among the ... Indians.

Like others with such sympathies, he publicly affirmed close relations, wedding Catherine of the Nez Perce of the Columbia River country in 1842.⁴⁴ While MacDonald stayed in his wife's country, others traveled more widely. HBC fur trader and railway magnate Donald Smith, later Lord Strathcona, born east of Inverness in 1820, married Isabel Hardisty, the daughter of a Scot and Native woman. Likely the model for Sir George and Lady Constance Bennington in Pauline Johnson's short story, "The Shagannappi," the devoted couple maintained palatial residences in the British Isles and Canada.⁴⁵

In the early stage of Native-Scots contact such relationships seemed natural enough. In the 1790s a Scottish traveler, Patrick Campbell, cheerfully reflected that Highlanders

were in many respects not a whit better than the real Indians; that they would set out in the dead of winter, with their guns and dogs; travel into the deep recesses of distant forests; continue there two or three weeks at a time, sleeping in the snow, and in the open air; and return with sleas loaded with venison; yet withal, were acknowledged to be the most prudent and industrious farmers in all this province of New Brunswick, and lived most easy and independent.⁴⁶

He was just as positive about racial mixing. An optimistic environmentalist, he concluded

To cross the breed of every species of creatures is deemed an advantage, but I am convinced it can be to none more than to the human species; as I do not remember to have seen an instance where a white man and an Indian woman did not produce handsome and well looking children.⁴⁷

Multiple generations of Mixed-race offspring gave ample opportunity to test such views.⁴⁸

On the prairies the Red River settlement was home to many such families. Lord Selkirk's early Highland recruits gradually mixed with Northwesters (themselves often of Scottish and Indian ancestry) and the Native nations of the region. Aboriginal languages joined Gaelic in the young community's Indian dances and Scottish reels and the business of fur trade life.⁴⁹ The resulting mixture was still positively summed up by one observer in the 1890s:

Although during the three quarters of a century there was a large infusion of Indian blood among these Scotch half-breeds, yet they were ever a thoroughly civilized people, retaining all the best characteristics of old Scotia. They are very industrious and thrifty, and are the contented owners of large farms and comfortable homes. ... here, in the wilderness, [was] a counterpart of a Highland Scottish parish, with a church which was well attended by a devout, Sabbath-keeping people. The illusion seemed the more perfect by our frequent hearing of the

drone of the bag-pipes and several of the half-breeds, fluently speaking Gaelic. Scottish thrift, rather than Indian shiftlessness, had been paramount among them.⁵⁰

Similar observations occurred elsewhere. One visitor to the home of John Ross, a Cherokee champion in the struggle against the Americans, commented that "he might as well have been in England or Scotland rather than the Cherokee wilds."⁵¹

New World descendants asserted their Scottish heritage in a variety of ways. Sometimes the Old World was the clear beneficiary. Learning of the "suffering poor of Scotland ... not less than 300,000 Scotch on the Highlands and Islands, who must through charity, be during the ensuing summer or die of famine," Ross, the grandson of Highlanders, responded positively and practically, with a substantial donation, to the questions, "Have the Scotch no claim upon the Cherokees? Have they not a very special claim? They have."⁵² Scotland might benefit from ties of kinship and emotion but North American Mixed-race offspring encountering racial prejudice also needed all the help they could muster. Hopes for a better reception in late nineteenth century British Columbia help explain, for example, why Charles Ross, the son of a Highland HBC factor and his part-Ojibway wife, left a remarkable photo of himself, his Native wife, Catherine Toma, and their children in full Highland dress.⁵³

Although North Americans might have special reason to claim kinship, those from the other side of the water such as Robert MacDougall in *The Emigrant's Guide to North America* (1841) also made connections. Originally in Gaelic, this volume devoted a chapter to the Natives of the Canadas, favourably noting many points of resemblance. Indian and Highland women walked with the "heavy, undulating gait" of those used to heavy burdens. Clothing and childcare arrangements sometimes seemed familiar. Chiefs like Tecumseh were as fierce and brave as Scottish clan leaders.⁵⁴ Like Patrick Campbell who addressed the Mohawk in Gaelic, "the Indian language" of his country, when suggesting they might unite to fight the "Yankees" in the 1790s,⁵⁵ MacDougall noted similarities in speaking. He went so far as to suggest that the Indians "have a slow, soft, pleasant speech, merely a branch of the Gaelic language, and if those who first wrote it down had been well acquainted with Gaelic, the two languages would look remarkable similar."⁵⁶ Given such appraisal, the Highland author considered Canada a promising home

for his country people.

In Peterborough, Ontario, the prolific writer and wife of an Orkneyman, Catharine Parr Traill, used a children's story to affirm the connection between the "savages" of two lands. Her *Canadian Carusoes* (1852) portrayed European youngsters identifying with a Native friend whom one of them would later marry. "Strongly imbued with a love of the marvelous, which they had inherited from their Highland origin," they considered the unimaginatively named "Indiana's respect for the spirits of her ancestors ... as most natural."⁵⁷ Traill's own sympathies were still more personally engaged when she became a loving grandmother to Mixed-race children in the Northwest.⁵⁸

The mounting pressure of European settlement soon, however, left little room for thoughts of kinship. George Simpson, the illegitimate son of a minor Highland gentleman and later head of the HBC, responded in an increasingly typical way in his brutal desertion of Mixed-race partners and children for the prestige of higher status European connections.⁵⁹ On the eastern side of the continent, Thomas Chandler Haliburton's stories of the American con man, Sam Slick, rehearsed typical calumny. One boat pilot regaled Slick with the case of Peter McDonald. This Gaelic-speaking Highlander, veteran of the NWC, was caricatured as having "married, broomstick fashion, I suppose, a squaw" and on her death moving with their "two half-caste daughters" to Saint John. That city did not welcome them

on account of their colour, and he came down here and settled at Ship Harbour, where some of his countrymen are located. He is as proud as Lucifer, and so are his galls. Whether it is that they have been slighted, and revenge it upon all the rest of the world, I do't know; or whether it is Highland and Indian pride mixed, I ain't sarified; but they carry their heads high, and show a stiff upper lip, I tell you.

The eldest was reckoned a "beauty" and there was "something in her manner you can't help thinking she is a lady".⁶⁰ Good looks and polite habits did not, however, save from insult those reckoned as members of lesser races.

The progeny of Highlanders and Indians could be especially suspect when they attempted to negotiate public forms for their hybrid national-

ity. As one 1885 correspondent to the *Toronto News* insisted, Mixed-race individuals "reared in the ways of civilized life who gain their living by trade or in the professions, and have only the very slightest physical traces of other than Caucasian origin, are simply masquerading when for political or self-interested purposes they write to the newspaper over barbarous polysyllabic signatures, and call themselves "indians." From this point of view, the writer argued, "It would be as sensible and rational a proceeding were some of our staid businessmen of Highland ancestry to walk along King Street in kilts with a phiabeg, skian dhu and all the other appropriate accompaniments of the old days of border feuds and cattle lifting, and style themselves "divine wassals." The professional Indian is a ridiculous anachronism."⁶¹ As it turned out, the cult of the Highlands, including dress, was embracing far more than the occasional businessman. Queen Victoria and her family eagerly succumbed. Although the Boy Scouts and Girl Guides of the early twentieth-century, like other children's organizations, exhibited considerable interest, American Native dress did not catch the imperial imagination in the same way. Simpson's repudiation of Native associations was the more typical.

At the end of the nineteenth century, the favourable linkage of Scots and Indians still found advocates. During the course of parliamentary debates over the 1885 Franchise Act, which promised enfranchisement to propertied Canadian Natives, two Scottish-Canadian MPs matter-of-factly noted the connection. Prime Minister John A. Macdonald observed of potential new Indian voters, "They are educated men; many of them are doing business and have large property. They are traders or merchants, who have engaged in all sorts of business. But they prefer to stick to the clan system, just as, until lately, in my own country, the Highlanders stuck to their clan system." Both communities have reason to proudly title themselves "British allies."⁶² The Conservative from Glengarry, Ontario, Donald MacMaster, extended the comparison: "My own ancestors in the Highlands of Scotland had not escaped from the bonds of savagery 150 years ago." Only after British troops broke the northern clans "did my noble countrymen, having succumbed to the fortunes of war, acquire all the advantages of civilisation." Conquered Scots discovered the "opportunities of empire" in enlisting in the British Army. Indians, like the legendary hero Tecumseh, similarly fought for the Empire.⁶³ Such observations made it clear that it was only right and proper that Indians join Scots as voters.

In detailing Native practices for eager readers, an 1890s visitor to Canada was equally comfortable with making comparisons. Housing attracted this observation: "The fire was on the floor in the middle, like some of the Highland cots, with an aperture to let out the smoke, and mats were laid around it for the people to sit or sleep upon, and their outer coats and various implements hung around."⁶⁴ Appraisal and opportunities were nevertheless diverging. The thousands of Highlanders who left Scotland for British North America were permitted to contribute significantly to the highest rank of colonial leadership. They benefited from an evolving racial science that identified Europeans in general as superior. American Natives on the other hand had to battle a designation that made them automatically a less worthwhile branch of humanity.

For all they might potentially share with the Indigenous peoples of North America, emigrant Scots were nevertheless far from their original home. The homeland pacified and remapped by British military surveys beginning in 1776 lay behind them.⁶⁵ North America was a foreign continent. Like other newcomers, they sought to rename the strange landscape—Cragellachie, the location of the driving of the last spike for the CPR is only one of many examples—to transform the alien into the familiar. In contrast, as Michael Marker has pointed out, Canada's First Nations assert an unmatched relationship to this continent.⁶⁶ Earlier, Pauline Johnson made much the same point when she described how Europeans retitled the landmarks of British Columbia but "without the love" which was in the "Indian heart."⁶⁷ Newcomers might stake their own imaginative claims or empathize with those who came before, but from the perspective of the original residents they remain outsiders.

Renaming was only one way Scots acted as conquerors. Victims they might be in the old country but elsewhere they regularly failed to demonstrate "solidarity with the various native peoples they encountered."⁶⁸ In the end poor and displaced Scots only too readily became "agents for the further intensification of land use in ... North America and Australasia, bearing down on the indigenous peoples of those places."⁶⁹ Other oppressed minorities, such as Nova Scotia blacks, fared little better at their hands.⁷⁰ Margaret Laurence reconstructs the frequently sorry record in her novel, *The Diviners* (1974). Its Manitoba Scots are so enamored of their own nostalgic story of oppression that they ignore their own mistreatment of Indians and Metis and reinforce the power of Euro-

pean ethnocentrism.⁷¹

In the Minds of Cultural Authorities

In the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries emerging social sciences debated the exact relationship among the world's human communities. Influential and Eurocentric apostles of the Scottish Enlightenment such as William Robertson and Adam Smith portrayed a progression in human development through hunting, grazing, farming and commerce. Highlanders and North American Natives occupied the early stages, a location that legitimized both dispossession and disappearance.⁷² An estate manager for the notorious landholder, the Countess of Sutherland, was able to justify the clearances and subsequent emigration by insisting that crofters, like Indians, "were shut out from the general stream of knowledge and cultivation."⁷³ The comparison went the other way as well. On an Arctic voyage of discovery, another Scot, Captain John Ross, readily assigned the Inuhuit of Thule or Greenland the title of "Arctic Highlanders" because of what he viewed as their savagery relative to their "Eskimoan," or he might well have said Lowland, neighbours.⁷⁴

The supposed evolutionary primitivism of the two peoples roused the later ire of Goldwin Smith, variously professor of history at Oxford and Cornell and all-round misanthrope.⁷⁵ From his perspective the Scottish chiefs "brought the claymores of their clansmen to the standard of their patron, as Indian chiefs in the American wars brought the tomahawks of their tribes to the standard of France or England." Their influence upon more civilized societies was only to be deplored. Toronto's distinguished citizen grumbled further that "Celtic independence greatly contributed to the general perpetuation of anarchy in Scotland, to the backwardness of Scotch civilization, and to the abortive weakness of the Parliamentary institutions." He was especially out of sorts when his conclusions were obviously in the minority. He could only seethe when despised Highlanders became "the pet soldiers, of the British monarchy."⁷⁶ Such prejudice was long-standing. Even at the end of the twentieth century modern scholars occasionally succumbed to the temptation to designate both Highlanders and North American Natives as "savage."⁷⁷

Accustomed to the sight of both groups in close communication and often familiar with the thinkers of the Scottish Enlightenment, from the beginning the young dominion's cultural authorities matter-of-factly

linked Natives of the old and new lands. The poet and charter member of the Royal Society of Canada, William Kirby, made the connection plain in his description of the confrontation of Highland regiments with Pontiac, the Ottawa champion, of the 1760s.

And men bare kneed, with bonnets eagle plumed,
 And kilted, with their pouches worn before;
 ... and Highland men
 From the wild Grampians, stalwart, bare of limb
 And terrible with battle cries and pipes
 That screamed in fight as wild as Indian yelles.⁷⁸

Bad versifiers were not alone. Ethnologists, anthropologists, folklorists, and historians went further still, affirming racial hierarchies which subordinated both Highlander and Indian. As one commentator complacently put it, "To our remote descendants the story of the Indian tribes will be a dim tradition, as that of the Celts and Picts and ancient Britons to us."⁷⁹ Much the same point was made by John Reade, a leading Canadian journalist and liberal sympathizer with his Indian contemporaries: "The Picts and the Scots, the Celts and the Gauls of the early centuries of the Christian era did not exhibit any higher civilization, and in many instances a much lower state of culture was manifested, than now is inherited by the majority of Indian tribes."⁸⁰ Henry Schoolcraft, a pioneer of North American anthropology, husband of an Ojibway woman and father to her children, was similarly confident in his comparison of "our Indians" and the early Britons. As he observed, arrows and spears were remarkably alike.⁸¹

Enthusiasts were ready to elaborate on supposed connections. Reade speculated that Northern American Natives were in fact descendants of early Europeans.⁸² In this assumption, he was joined by one early Canadian anthropologist, Horatio Hale, who celebrated the "mixed races" of Europe. They originated, he observed from "many tribes, scattered in loose bands over the country, and speaking languages widely and sometimes radically different." Their "canoes," remnants of which survived in peat bogs and alluvial deposits, also indicated that early inhabitants of Europe might "easily" have traveled across the Atlantic in much the same way as the Polynesians had explored the Pacific. This explained the resemblance between "ancient Europeans" and contemporary Basques

and Indians. Both were

imbued with the strongest possible sense of personal independence, and ... a passion for political freedom. They were also shrewd, practical, observant people, with little taste for abstract reasoning. ... among the western Celts, as among the American Indians, the love of freedom would become exalted to an almost morbid distrust of all governing authority.⁸³

And so Hale, a longtime admirer of the Iroquois mode of government and friend of Pauline Johnson's father, concluded that a shared pre-Aryan heritage helped explain comparable civilizations found on two continents.

The singling out of the much-studied Iroquois, both for special attention and for their similarity to Highlanders, was common. One 1897 history of the "longhouse people" matter-of-factly outlined the comparison:

Feathered head-dress, short coat or tunic, kilt and plaid, the leggings of the Indian are simply an elongated form of the Highland mogan or footless stocking and the moccasin resembles the ancient Highland brog, instead of moccasins the Indians sometimes wore a boot made of fur not unlike the ancient Highland fur boot or buskin, the firebag and the sporran are almost identical, to which may be added the similarity in form of waist and shoulder belts, the round shield, and the accompaniment of arms without which neither dress is complete. Also as the Highlander delights in gay colours and many ornaments, so does the Indian.⁸⁴

In linking the Iroquois and the Scots, post-Confederation Canadians connected new and old lands. The appropriation of Native and Scottish symbols in nationalist iconography, whether they be Native warriors like Joseph Brant and Tecumseh⁸⁵ or Highland societies and games and kilted regiments was especially tempting for intellectuals fearing a modern age cursed supposedly with effeminacy and commercialism.⁸⁶

Although their assessments only infrequently survive, occasional Native North Americans have left their own observations about their supposed resemblance to Caledonians. Peter Jacobs, an Ojibwa Methodist

missionary, experienced the confusion at first hand when presented to Queen Victoria. Asked if his native apparel was "Highland Scotch dress," he replied in the negative and took special note of the suggestion in his reminiscences.⁸⁷ Other Native guests of imperial hosts remarked on similarities. At the annual dinner of the Royal Highland Society presided over by the Duke of Richmond, another Ojibwa drew his own ethnographic conclusions:

most of the guests at the table were in full highland dress, and with their kilts, and with their badges and plaids of their particular clans. The scene was altogether a very picturesque one, and I observed that their chiefs wore the eagle's quills for the same purpose and in the same manner that the Indians do; but I did not see any of them painted red, as the Indians paint them, to adorn their heads as symbols of war when they are going into battle.⁸⁸

Such an observation, with its powerful invocation of the "picturesque" commonly used by imperial observers in their depiction of other, supposedly inferior, peoples of the world, deftly and subtly turned the tables in favour of the North American Native.⁸⁹

Years of such comparisons lay behind Pauline Johnson's claim in the 1880s of "one common Brotherhood" under the rule of "England's Noble Queen."⁹⁰ Elsewhere in the course of a short story for boys, she insisted again on equality for those on the margins: "'These Indians *look* savage, in their paint and feathers, but King Edward of England has no better subjects; and I guess it is all the same to His Majesty whether a good subject dresses in buckskin or broadcloth."⁹¹ Yet again, her salute to a Sioux chief, "a greater Britisher," extended the theme of faithfulness into the prairies.⁹² As her patriotic campaign song, "The Good Old N.[ational] P.[olicy]" (1896), also made clear, Natives were full partners in the new national enterprise:

And shoulder-to-shoulder we'll stand,
We may differ in creed and in colour,
French, and English and Red men are we,
But we're one for our cause and our country,
We are one for the good old N.[ational] P[olicy].

Connections between European newcomers and Natives went beyond surface details, to the heart of the land itself. Johnson's espousal of a gospel of northernness, that Carl Berger reminds us was commonplace in the nineteenth-century, supplied a further way of linking the British, especially Scots, and North American Native peoples. While often interpreted solely to the advantage of whites, theories about the benefits of northern climes promised to impart heroic capacity to others.⁹³ Yet, if the idea of the north was critical to the original imagining of Canada, as witnessed in the words of the national anthem itself, it was insufficient to inspire acceptance of an inclusive community. During the celebration of Quebec's Tercentenary in 1908, Natives, notably the Iroquois, provided a highly visible but, at that moment largely impotent reminder of "a third force struggling to be heard, interspersed between English and French."⁹⁴ Ultimately, those of Highland and First Nations descent remained no more than colourful props to the imperially-sanctioned staging of bi-cultural Canada represented by Quebec's Tercentenary.

The course of the reputation of Highland peoples did not for the most part, however, mirror that of North American Aborigines. While the former fell in the midst of early conflicts in the British Isles, Scots eventually benefited from the expansion of the second British Empire. First Nations faced a different fate. Bruce Trigger has catalogued the tragic trajectory.⁹⁵ Idealized images fell by the wayside as the scientific racism of the nineteenth century assigned inferiority and, for the most part, decline and disappearance to North America's Aboriginal communities. The Native struggle for equality, for the most part a lonely one, would continue into the twenty-first-century.

For a significant moment, however, the vanquished of two continents fared much the same under the imperial gaze. Indians and Highlanders encountered each other as custodians of losing causes. Here lay, as Katie Trumpener points out, the potential both for "an international solidarity at once militantly anti-imperial and militantly nationalist" and for renewed injustice should the Scots re-enact their own conquest on the bodies of others.⁹⁶ What meaning that contradictory inheritance has for a nation whose origins already resonated with loss, of France, of the American colonies, remains to be considered. Defeated communities can struggle for supremacy or search for allies; they can accept exploitation or repudiate it. Canada's history provides evidence of both choices. Pauline Johnson's empathetic identification with the Highlands, the home-

land of so many European immigrants, suggests one way that the nation might have been imaginatively constructed to make room for newcomer and Native alike.

Notes

- * My thanks to Jean Barman, Leith Davis, Carole Gerson, Jack Little, and Michael Marker for their comments on an earlier draft of this work.
- 1 Veronica Strong-Boag and Carole Gerson, *Paddling Her Own Canoe: The Times and Texts of E. Pauline Johnson* (Tekahionwake) (Toronto: University of Toronto Press 2000). A second volume, edited by Gerson and Strong-Boag, comprising all Johnson's poetry and a selection of her prose is expected from the same press in 2002 and all citations from Johnson's work come that volume.
 - 2 Quoted in "Fate of the Red Man," from the *London Canadian Gazette* in *Ottawa Daily Free Press* (21 June 1894), 3.
 - 3 18th Century England was regularly self-figured "as Augustan Rome". Katie Trumpener, *Bardic Nationalism. The Romantic Novel and the British Empire* (Princeton: Princeton University Press 1997), 3. Fascinatingly Jacobitism was also characterized by a tradition of "warrior women". See Murray G.H. Pittock, *Jacobitism* (London: Macmillan 1998), 78-82.
 - 4 William R. Brock and C. Helen Brock, *Scotus Americanus. A Survey of Sources for Links between Scotland and America in the Eighteen Century* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press 1982) and William C. Lehmann, *Scottish and Scotch-Irish Contributions to Early American Life and Culture* (Port Washington, New York: Kennikat Press 1978).
 - 5 See for example Olive Dickason, *Canada's First Nations: A History of Founding Peoples from Earliest Times*, 2nd ed. (Toronto: Oxford University Press 1997). Sylvia Van Kirk, a long-time scholar of Native-European interaction on the fur trade frontier presents suggestive material in her recent article, "Tracing the Fortunes of Five Founding Families of Victoria," *BC Studies*, 115/116 (1997/98), 149-79 but doesn't take up the larger question of the special relationship of Natives and Scots.
 - 6 See Murray G.H. Pittock, *The Myth of the Jacobite Clans* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press 1995) for an authoritative and lively treatment of this subject.
 - 7 Peter Womack, *Improvement and Romance. Constructing the Myth of the Highlands* (London: Macmillan 1989), 21.
 - 8 See Womack, *Improvement and Romance*, 7-8 and Marilyn Burgess and Gail Guthrie Valaskakis, *Indian Princesses and Cowgirls: Stereotypes from the Frontier/Princesses Indiennes et Cow-girls: Stéréotypes de la*

Frontière (Montreal, Oboro 1995).

- 9 See Ian Adams and Meredyth Somerville, *Cargoes of Despair and Hope. Scottish Emigration to North America 1603-1803* (Edinburgh: John Donald Publ. Ltd. 1993).
- 10 See Colin Kidd, "The Rehabilitation of Scottish Jacobitism," *The Scottish Historical Review* 87: 1, 203 (1998), 58-76 for a reminder of the political nature of the Jacobite rehabilitation.
- 11 Charles Withers, "The Historical Creation of The Scottish Highlands," in Ian Donnachie and Christopher Whatley, ed., *The Manufacture of Scottish History* (Edinburgh: Polygon 1992), 145.
- 12 Ewen A. Cameron, "Embracing the Past: The Highlands in Nineteenth Century Scotland," in Dauvit Broun, R.J. Finlay and Michael Lynch, eds., *Image and Identity: The Making and Re-making of Scotland Through the Ages* (Edinburgh: John Donald Pub. Ltd. 1998), 206-7.
- 13 Withers, "The Historical Creation of The Scottish Highlands," 150.
- 14 Womack, *Improvement and Romance*, 59.
- 15 Womack, *Improvement and Romance*, 60.
- 16 Anne McClintock, *Imperial Leather: Race, Gender and Sexuality in the Colonial Contest* (New York and London: Routledge 1995), 52-3.
- 17 John S. Ellis, "Reconciling the Celt: British National Identity, Empire, and the 1911 Investiture of the Prince of Wales," *Journal of British Studies* 37 (1998), 417.
- 18 Ellis, "Reconciling the Celt," 415.
- 19 See Marjory Harper and Michael E. Vance, "Myth, Migration and the Making of Memory: An Introduction," in Marjory Harper and Michael E. Vance, eds., *Myth, Migration and the Making of Memory* (Halifax: Fernwood Publishing 1999).
- 20 David Stewart, *Sketches of the Highlanders of Scotland*, 2nd edition, I, (Edinburgh 1977), 320 as quoted in James Hunter, *A Dance Called America. The Scottish Highlands, the United States and Canada* (Edinburgh and London: Mainstream Publishing 1994), 65.
- 21 Quoted from Knox's *Historical Campaign* in George Warburton, *The Conquest of Canada* (London: R. Bentley, 1849) 177. Spelling as in original text.
- 22 See James Axtell, *The European and the Indian. Essays in the Ethnohistory of Colonial North America* (New York: Oxford University Press 1981), 199.
- 23 On the significance of hair see Axtell, *The European and the Indian*, 61.
- 24 Axtell, *The European and the Indian*, 178.
- 25 Stewart, *Sketches of the Highlanders of Scotland*, 296 as quoted in Hunter, *A Dance Called America*, 236.
- 26 See Marianne McLean, *The People of Glengarry. Highlanders in Transi-*

- tion, 1745-1820. (Montreal and Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press 1991), 82-8.
- 27 See Gretchen Green, "Molly Brant, Catharine Brant, and Their Daughters: A Study in Colonial Acculturation," *Ontario History* 81,3 (1989), 235-50.
- 28 Patrick Campbell, *Travels in the interior inhabited parts of North America in the years 1791 and 1792* (Toronto: Champlain 1937), 227.
- 29 McLean, *The People of Glengarry*, 91.
- 30 McLean, *The People of Glengarry*, 93.
- 31 Janet Carnochan, *Niagara One Hundred Years Ago* (Welland, ON: Lundy's Lane Historical Society 1892?), 18.
- 32 See Roy McLaren, *Canadians on the Nile* (Vancouver: UBC Press 1978).
- 33 *Vancouver Province* (8 March 1913).
- 34 "Brant. A Memorial Ode".
- 35 George F.G. Stanley, "The Scottish Military Tradition," in W. Stanford Reid, ed., *The Scottish Tradition in Canada* (Toronto: McClelland & Stewart 1977), 136-60.
- 36 Lord Dufferin as quoted in J.T. Gilkison (compiler), *Narrative Visit of the Governor-General and the Countess of Dufferin to the Six Nations Indians August 25, 1874* (1875).
- 37 Trumpener, *Bardic Nationalism*, 217.
- 38 For a useful guide to the chronology of Scots settlement in Canada see J.M. Bumsted, "Scottishness and Britishness in Canada, 1790-1914," *Myth, Migration and the Making of Memory*. Until 1815 the Highland Scots dominated immigration to the British North America.
- 39 See Elaine Allan Mitchell, "The Scot in the Fur Trade," in *The Scottish Tradition in Canada*, 27-48 and Bumsted, *Fur Trade Wars* (Winnipeg: Great Plains Publications 1999).
- 40 Mary Wilson Alloway, *Famous Firesides of French Canada*. (Montreal?: n.p. 1894?), 195.
- 41 John Galt, *The Canadas* (London: E. Wilson 1832), 221-2.
- 42 See Strong-Boag and Gerson, *Paddling Her Own Canoe*, chpt. 1.
- 43 W. Kaye Lamb, *The Journals and Letters of Sir Alexander Mackenzie* (Toronto: MacMillan 1970).
- 44 Quoted in Hunter, *A Dance Called America*, 235.
- 45 See Alexander Reford, "Smith, Donald Alexander, 1e baron Strathcona and Mount Royal," *Dictionary of Canadian Biography* 14 (1911-20), 1024-33 and Donna McDonald, *Lord Strathcona* (Toronto: Dundurn Press 1996). Lord and Lady Strathcona returned in triumph to Scotland where they purchased the Hebridean island of Colonsay and an extensive estate in the West Highlands.
- 46 Campbell, *Travels*, 46.

- 47 Campbell, *Travels*, 225.
- 48 See for example the Mixed-race men profiled in Margaret MacLeod and W.L. Morton, *Cuthbert Grant of Grantown*. (Toronto: McClelland & Stewart 1974) and Barry Cooper, *Alexander Kennedy Isbister. A respectable Critic of the Honourable Company*. (Ottawa: Carleton University Press 1988),
- 49 On the dancing see Campbell, *Travels*, 169 and John West, *The Substance of a Journal during a Residence at the Red River Colony, British North America...* (London: L.B. Seeley 1824), 51.
- 50 Egerton R. Young, *Stories from Indian Wigwams and Northern Campfires* (Toronto and Montreal: C.W. Coates, W. Briggs 189?), 52.
- 51 Gary Moulton, *John Ross Cherokee Chief* (Athens: University of Georgia Press 1978), 6.
- 52 John Ross, "To the Editor of the Cherokee Advocate" (28 April 1847) in *The Papers of Chief John Ross*, edited, with an Introduction by Gary Moulton, v. II (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press 1985), 321.
- 53 Van Kirk, "Tracing the Fortunes of Five Founding Families of Victoria," *BC Studies*, 115/116 (1997/98), 172.
- 54 Robert MacDougall, *The Emigrant's Guide to North America* ed. Elizabeth Thompson (Winnipeg: Natural Heritage Books 1998), 31, 32-6, 36-8.
- 55 Campbell, *Travels*, 168.
- 56 MacDougall, *The Emigrant's Guide to North America*, 39.
- 57 C.P. Traill, *Canadian Crusoes: a tale of the Rice Lake Plains* (London: A. Hall, Virtue 1852), 232. See also Carole Gerson, "Nobler Savages: Representatives of Native Women in the Writings of Susanna Moodie and Catharine Parr Traill," *Journal of Canadian Studies* 32, 2 (1997), 5-21.
- 58 For her letters to her son and Mixed-race daughter-in-law see Carl Ballstadt, Carl, Elizabeth Hopkins, and Michael A. Peterman, eds., *I Bless You in My Heart: Selected Correspondence of Catharine Parr Trail*. (Toronto: University of Toronto Press 1996).
- 59 On Simpson see Van Kirk, "*Many Tender Ties*": *Women in Fur-Trade Society, 1670-1870* (Winnipeg: Watson & Dwyer 1980).
- 60 T. C. Haliburton, *Nature and Human Nature* (London: Hurst and Blackett 1859?), 36.
- 61 "Bogus Indians," (excerpt from *Toronto News*), *Brantford Expositor* (27 November 1885).
- 62 Canada. House of Commons *Debates*. 1885, v. 2, p. 1574.
- 63 Canada. House of Commons *Debates*. 1885, v. 2, pp. 2380-1. On McMaster see George Maclean Rose, *A Cyclopaedia of Canadian Biography* (Toronto: Rose Pub. Co., 1886).
- 64 Catherine L. Johnston, *Winter and Summer Excursions in Canada* (Lon-

- don: Digby, Logan 1894?), 122
- 65 Trumpener, *Bardic Nationalism*, 25.
- 66 For a discussion of this viewpoint, see Michael Marker, "Lummi Identity and White Racism: When Location is a Real Place," *Qualitative Studies in Education* 13, 4 (2000), 401-441.
- 67 "The Two Sisters," *Legends of Vancouver* (Toronto: McClelland & Stewart, 1925), 3.
- 68 Hunter, *A Dance Called America*, 236.
- 69 Eric Richards, "Leaving the Highlands: Colonial Destinations in Canada and Australia," *Myth, Migration and the Making of Memory*, 107.
- 70 Harper and Vance, "Myth, Migration and the Making of Memory: An Introduction," *Myth, Migration and the Making of Memory*, 37.
- 71 Trumpener, *Bardic Nationalism*, 254.
- 72 For a balanced assessment of Scottish Enlightenment theorists and the idea of the savage see Ronald L. Meek, *Social Science and the ignoble savage* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press 1976). For the specific reference to the Highlands and Islands see pp. 137. See also Christopher J. Berry, *Social Theory of the Scottish Enlightenment* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press 1997), especially chapters 5 and 8.
- 73 R. J. Adam, ed., *Papers on Sutherland Estate Management*, I (Edinburgh 1972) as quoted in Hunter, *A Dance Called America*, 175-6.
- 74 Quoted in Michael T. Bravo, "The Anti-Anthropology of Highlanders and Islanders," *Studies in History and Philosophy of Science* 29, 3 (1998), 372.
- 75 See Veronica Strong-Boag, "Independent Women and Problematic Men: First and Second Wave Anti-Feminism in Canada from Goldwin Smith to Betty Steele," *Histoire social/Social History* 29, 57 (1996), 1-22. Smith had a long list of those he appeared to despise, including Natives, Highlanders, Jews, Blacks, and women.
- 76 Goldwin Smith, *Lectures and Essays* (New York and Toronto: MacMillan, Hunter Rose 1881), 33.
- 77 See the examples cited by Murray G.H. Pittock, *The Myth of the Jacobite Clans* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press 1995), 10.
- 78 William Kirby, *Pontiac; and, Bushy Run* (Niagara, ON: n.p. 1887), 24, 32.
- 79 William H. Withrow, *Our Own Country: Canada, scenic and descriptive* (Toronto: William Briggs 1889), 489.
- 80 John Reade, *The Literary Faculty of the Native Races of America*. (Montreal: Dawson 1884), 276.
- 81 H.R. Schoolcraft. *The American Indians: their history, condition and prospects, from original notes and manuscripts* (Buffalo: G.H. Derby 1851), 219.

- 82 Reade, *The Literary Faculty of the Native Races of America*, 28. At various times European commentators believed American indigenous peoples to be the descendants of inter alia the Phoenicians, the Israelites, and the Scandinavians. See Meek, *Social Science and the ignoble savage*, 44-54.
- 83 Horatio Hale, *Indian Migrations, as evidenced by language* (Chicago?: n.p. 1883), 25-6.
- 84 Edward Chadwick, *The People of the Longhouse* (Toronto: Church of England Pub. 1897), 70.
- 85 See Daniel Francis, *The Imaginary Indian. The Image of the Indian in Canadian Culture*. Vancouver, Arsenal Pulp Press, 1993.
- 86 On this appeal see David Wright, "A. W.D. Lighthall and David Ross McCord: Antimodernism and English-Canadian Imperialism, 1880s-1918," *Journal of Canadian Studies* 32, 2 (1997), 134-53.
- 87 John Carroll, *Case and his Contemporaries* (Toronto: Wesleyan Conference Office 1874), 206.
- 88 George Catlin, *Adventures of the Ojibbeway and Ioway Indians in England, France, and Belgium...* (London: G. Catlin 1852), 661.
- 89 On the picturesque and the imperial eye see Mary Louise Pratt, *Imperial Eyes: Travel Writing and Transculturation* (London: Routledge, 1992).
- 90 "Brant. A Memorial Ode".
- 91 E. Pauline Johnson, "A Night with 'North Eagle'", *The Shagganappi* (Toronto, William Briggs 1913), 75. Her emphasis.
- 92 "Trails of the Old Tillicums," *Daily Province* (Vancouver) (31 Dec. 1910).
- 93 On the cult of the north see Strong-Boag and Gerson, *Paddling Her Own Canoe*, chpt. 5 and Carl Berger, *The Sense of Power: Studies in the Ideas of Canadian Imperialism, 1867-1914* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press 1971).
- 94 H.V. Nelles, *The Art of Nation-Building. Pageantry and Spectacle at Quebec's Tercentenary*. Toronto: University Toronto Press 1999), 78.
- 95 Bruce Trigger, "The Historians' Indian: Native Americans in Canadian Historical Writing from Charlevoix to the Present," *Canadian Historical Review* 68, 3 (1986), 315-342.
- 96 Trumpener, *Bardic Nationalism*, xiii.